
Muhammad Sa'eed Ramadaan al-Bootee Affirms the 'Aqeedah of the Mu'tazilah Concerning the Speech of Allaah

Prepared by the Sunnah Publishing Editorial Staff

Version 1.0

Muhammad Sa'eed Ramadaan al-Bootee¹ said, "As for the Speech (of Allaah), which is the wording, then they (*Ahlu-Sunnah* and the *Mu'tazilah*) are all agreed that it is created, and that it does not emanate from the Essence (*dhaat*) of Allaah the Most Perfect; with the exception of Ahmad Ibn Hanbal and some of his followers. So indeed they held that these letters and recitations are also old in their essence, and that their meaning is the Attribute of Speech."²

[1]: As for his statement, "As for the Speech (of Allaah), which is the wording, then they (*Ahlu-Sunnah* and the *Mu'tazilah*) are all agreed that it is created..."

Ahmad Ibn Sa'eed ad-Daarimee (d.255H) said, "I said to Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, 'I will say to you a statement, and if you oppose anything from it, then say, 'I oppose it.' I said to him, 'We say that the *Qur'aan*, from its beginning to its end, is the Speech of Allaah, nothing from it is created. And whoever claims that something from it is created, then he is a disbeliever.' So he did not oppose anything from it and was pleased with it."³

Imaam Ahmad (d.241H) - *rahimahullaah* - said, "The *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah in all situations from amongst the situations; it is not created."⁴

¹ **Muhammad Sa'eed Ramadaan al-Bootee:** Shaykh Rabe'e Ibn Haadee alMadkhalee mentions him in *Jamaa'ah Waahidah* (p. 79, 138). Shaykh Rabe'e also mentions him in *al-Haddul-Faasil* (p. 15) and *an-Nasrul-'Azeez* (p. 146, 189). Shaykh Rabe'e said about him in *Manhaj Ahlu-Sunnah* (p. 121), "The books of al-Bootee are adversaries of the *Sunnah*, adversaries against the school of *Tawheed* and adversaries against the school of Ibn Taymiyyah." From amongst those Scholars who have refuted al-Bootee are Imaam al-Albaanee (1420H) in his book, *Difaa' 'anil-Hadeethin-Nabawee*, al-'Allamah Saalih al-Fawzaan in his book, *al-Baynaan li Akhtaa' Ba'dil-Kuttaab* and others.

² Refer to *Kubraa al-Yaqeeniyatul-Kawniyyah* (p. 126) 8th edition, Daarul-Fikr of Muhammad Sa'eed Ramadaan al-Bootee.

³ Related by Ibn Abee Haatim, as is found in *Tabaqaatul-Hanaabilah* (1/46).

⁴ Related by Ibn Haanee' in *al-Masaa'il* (2/158).

Ishaaq Ibn Raahawayh (d.238H) said, "There is no difference amongst the people of knowledge that the *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah, and that it is not created. So how can something which comes out from the Lord - the Mighty and Majestic - be created?"⁵

Muhammad Ibn Aslam at-Toosee said, "The *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah, it is not created, regardless of where it is read, or however it is written, it does not become distorted, altered, nor changed."⁶

[2]: As for his statement, "...and that it does not emanate from the Essence of Allaah the Most Perfect..."

Imaam Ahmad Ibn Hanbal (d.241H) said, "I met the men, Scholars and jurists of Makkah and al-Madeenah and al-Koofah and al-Basrah and ash-Shaam and ath-Thughoor and Khurasaan. So I saw them to be upon the *Sunnah* and the *Jamaa'ah*, so I asked them about it - meaning the wording. So all of them said that the *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah, it is not created; from Him it began and to Him it shall return."⁷

And he - *rahimahullaah* - said, "Allaah will not cease to be the Knower and the Speaker. We worship Allaah by His Attributes, which are not limited, nor known except with what He described Himself with. And we refer the *Qur'aan* back to the One who is knowledgeable of it, to Allaah the Blessed and Exalted. So He is knowledgeable of it, it emanated from Him and to Him it shall return."⁸

Aboo Ja'far Ahmad Ibn Sinaan (d.256H) - *rahimahullaah* - said, "Whosoever claims that the *Qur'aan* is two things, or that the *Qur'aan* is a narrative, then he is - by Allaah besides Whom there is no other true deity - a heretic, a disbeliever in Allaah. This *Qur'aan* is the *Qur'aan* that Allaah revealed through Jibreel (*'alayhis-salaam*) upon the tongue of Muhammad (*sallallaahu 'alayhi wa sallam*) without distortion, nor alteration.

"Falsehood cannot approach it from in front of it, nor from behind it. It is revealed from the Wise and Praiseworthy." [Sooratul-Fussilat 41:42]

And Allaah the Mighty and Majestic said,

"Say: If all of mankind and the Jinn were to unite for the purpose of bringing about the likes of this *Qur'aan*, they would not be able to bring about the likes of it." [Sooratul-Israa' 17:88]

So if a man were to take an oath not to speak for a day, then he read the *Qur'aan*, or he prayed and read the *Qur'aan*, he would not have broken his oath. Nothing is to be taken as

⁵ Related by Ibn Abee Haatim, as is found in *al'Uluww* (p. 132) of adh-Dhahabee.

⁶ Related by Ibn Abee Haatim, as is found in *al'Uluww* (p. 140) of adh-Dhahabee.

⁷ Refer to *Ikhtisaasul-Qur'aan* (no. 9), from al-Marroodhee from Ahmad.

⁸ Refer to *al-Mihnah* (p. 45) of Hanbal.

an analogy with the Speech of Allaah. The *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah, from Him it emanated and to Him it shall return. Nothing from Allaah is created, nor are His Attributes, Names, nor Knowledge created.”⁹

[3]: And as for his statement, “...with the exception of Ahmad Ibn Hanbal and some of his followers.”

'Amr Ibn Deenaar (d.126H) - *rahimahullaah* - said, “I knew the Companions of the Prophet (*sallallaahu 'alayhi wa sallam*). So whoever was from amongst them from the past seventy years used to say: Allaah is the Creator, and everything other than Him is creation. And the *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah, it emanated from Him and to Him it shall return.”¹⁰

Sufyaan ath-Thawree (d.167H) - *rahimahullaah* - said, “The *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah, it is not created. It emanated from Him and to Him it shall return, and whoever says other than this, then he is a disbeliever.” A man asked Sufyaan Ibn 'Uyaynah (d.197H) about the *Qur'aan*, ‘O Abaa Muhammad, what do you say about the *Qur'aan*?’ So he said, ‘It is the Speech of Allaah, it came out from Him, and to Him it shall return.’ Aboo Bakr Ibn 'Ayyaash (d.193H) said, “The *Qur'aan* is the Speech of Allaah, it was taught to Jibreel who taught it to Muhammad (*sallallaahu 'alayhi wa sallam*). It emanated from Him and to Him it shall return.”¹¹

So in mentioning this, al-Bootee “places the Imaam of *Ahlus-Sunnah* in opposition to *Ahlus-Sunnah*, and he ascribed deviation to his '*aqeedah* (creed). He ascribed the '*aqeedah* of the *Mu'tazilah*¹² - which negates the Speech from Allaah - to *Ahlus-Sunnah*. And then he

⁹ Refer to *Ikhtisaasul-Qur'aan* (no. 16).

¹⁰ Refer to *Ikhtisaasul-Qur'aan* (no. 6).

¹¹ All three of these narrations - which come from other than 'Ahmad Ibn Hanbal and some of his followers' can be found in *Ikhtisaasul-Qur'aan* (p. 138).

¹² **Mu'tazilah:** It is a sect that appeared in the later part of the second century when 'Amr Ibn 'Ubayd and Waasil Ibn 'Ataa' abandoned (*i'tazala*) the *Jamaa'ah* after the death of al-Hasan al-Basree (d.110H). Indeed, these people established their *madhhab* upon five basic principles, they were: [i] justice (*al'adl*); [ii] *Tawheed*; [iii] implementing the threat (of Allaah); [iv] a level between two levels (for the one who has committed a major sin); [v] enjoining the good and prohibiting the evil. In these principles, they mixed truth with falsehood. Such is the affair with all of the innovators.

They are *mushabbihah* (anthropomorphists) with regards to the actions (*af'aa*l), since they bound the actions of Allaah the Exalted upon the actions of His servants. And they made the goodness that is performed by His servants the goodness that is from Him, and whatever of despicableness occurs from His servants is His despicableness. They would say that it is obligatory to do such and such, and it is not permissible to do such and such, basing that upon their corrupt *qiyaas* (analogical deduction). According to them, *Tawheed* was from the intellectual principles, which do not recognize the texts, except as a secondary source. So when they do seek proof of that with textual evidence, then they only mention it as supporting evidence, not something to be relied upon. So the *Mu'tazilah* possess many heresies. And amongst them were those who were misguided in their efforts in the life of this world, yet they reckon that their works are good. Refer to *al-Milal wan-Nihal* (1/43-46), *Sharhul'Aqeedatit-Tahaawiyyah* (p. 521-522), *al-Burhaan fee Ma'rifah 'Aqaa'id Ahlil-Adyaan* (p. 27) and *Dhikr Madhaahibil-Firaq* (p. 49) of al-Yaafi'ee.

presents it to the reader as the 'aqeedah of *Ahlu-Sunnah* and their *Imaam*, yet *Ahlu-Sunnah* are free from what he ascribes to them.”¹³

And Aboo Ja'far Muhammad Ibn Haaron al-Mukhrimee al-Fallaas said, “If you see a man finding fault with Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, then know that he is a misguided innovator.”¹⁴

The Position of the Salaf Concerning the Speech Emanating from Allaah:

So since these statements from the Scholars of the *Salaf* have already refuted al-Bootee's statement, “...and that it does not emanate from the Essence of Allaah the Most Perfect,” it becomes necessary to explain what the position of the *Salaf* meant.

Shaykhul-Islam Ibn Taymiyyah (d.728H) - *rahimahullaah* - said, “And the statement of the *Salaf*, ‘From Him it emanated,’ did not mean by this that it separated from His Essence and took up residence in other than Him and so therefore the Speech is created. Rather, none of His Attributes have separated from Him and changed location to other than Him. So how is it possible for the Speech of Allaah to separate from His Essence, or other than it from the Attributes?”¹⁵

He also said, “And from that which Ahmad opposed was the statement of the *Jahmiyyah* alleging that the *Qur'aan* is not found in the chests, nor in the books.”¹⁶

[4]: And as for his statement, “So indeed they held that these letters and voices are old (i.e. created), and that their meaning is the Attribute of Speech.”

So here al-Bootee has claimed that the letters of the *Qur'aan* and the voices (i.e. recitation) are created. However, Allaah said,

“And indeed We know that they say, “It is only a human being who teaches him,” the tongue of the one whom they refer to is foreign, and this is in clear Arabic language.”
[Sooratur-Nahl 16:103]

From Ibn 'Abbaas (*radiyallaahu 'anhu*) who said, “When Jibreel was sitting with the Prophet (*sallallaahu 'alayhi wa sallam*), he heard a strange sound from above, so he raised his head and said, “This is a door from the sky that has been opened today, it has never been opened, except upon this day.” So an angel descended from it, so he said. “This is an angel that has descended to the earth, it has never descended except today.” So he greeted them and said, ‘I give you glad tidings of two lights that I have come to give you, they have not

¹³ From the words of 'Abdullaah ash-Shaamee al-Atharee in *al-Asaalih* (issue 11, p. 61-62).

¹⁴ Refer to *al-Jarh wat-Ta'deel* (p. 308-309) and *Taareekh Dimashq* (5/294).

¹⁵ Refer to *Majmoo'ul-Fataawaa* (12/274, 517-518, 550) of Ibn Taymiyyah.

¹⁶ Refer to *Majmoo'ul-Fataawaa* (12/388) of Ibn Taymiyyah.

been given to anyone before you, al-Faatihah and the last *ayah* of al-Baqarah. You will not recite a letter from them, except that it will be given to you.”¹⁷

'Abdullaah Ibn Mas'ood (*radiyallaahu 'anhu*) said, “Learn the *Qur'aan*. Indeed, every letter from it that is written, ten rewards are obtained, and ten sins are expiated. I do not say that 'Alif Laam Meem,' is ten, rather, I say that *Alif* is ten and *Laam* is ten, and *Meem* is ten.”¹⁸

Shu'ayb Ibn Habhaab said, “Whenever a man used to recite with Abul'Aaliyah (d.90H), and he did not recite as he recited, rather, he said, “As for me, then I shall recite it as such and such.” He said, “So I mentioned that to Ibraaheem an-Nakha'ee (d.95H), so he said, ‘I see that your companion has heard that whoever disbelieves in a single letter from it, then indeed he disbelieves in all of it.’”¹⁹

¹⁷ Related by Muslim (no. 806), an-Nisaa'ee (2/138), al-Haakim in *al-Mustadrak* (1/558-559) and Ibn Hibbaan (no. 766).

¹⁸ Related by Ibn Abee Shaybah in *al-Musannaf* (10/461).

¹⁹ Related by Ibn Abee Shaybah in *al-Musannaf* (10/513-514) and by Ibn Jareer in his *Tafseer* (no. 56).